

A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF PAKISTANI & INDIAN ENGLISH DAILIES EDITORIALS ON THE COVERAGE OF DETERIORATING CONDITIONS OF INDIAN MUSLIMS

Muhammad FAHİM

Riphah International University, Pakistan

muhammadfahimdawer@gmail.com

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4342-3068>

<i>Atf</i>	Fahim, M. (2021). A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF PAKISTANI & INDIAN ENGLISH DAILIES EDITORIALS ON THE COVERAGE OF DETERIORATING CONDITIONS OF INDIAN MUSLIMS. <i>İstanbul Aydın Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi</i> , 13(2), 501-532
------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

ABSTRACT

This research examines the stance/slant and the magnitude of media coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. Minorities in India, especially the Indian Muslims, enduring an institutional and systematic bias and neglect in all walks of life. Though the Indian constitution bestows equal rights to all its subjects, however, the ground reality is telling completely an opposite story. The Indian Muslims fell victim to communal violence myriads of times since the inception of modern India. Moreover, since Modi's assertion into the throne, the situation worsened.

The purpose of this research was to examine the stance/slant and the magnitude of media coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. Two Indian (Times of Indian & Hindustan Time) and two Pakistani (Dawn & The Nation) English dailies were selected for this study based on their circulation and influence in public and the power corridors. The method of content analysis was castoff to fulfill the needs of the study. Six months (Aug 11, 2019, to Feb 11, 2020) of editorial coverage of the said dailies were examined through content analysis. A total of 57 editorials were found published about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims and were examined through content analysis. 23 editorials of Times of India, 14 of Hindustan Times, and 10 each of Dawn and The Nation were found published and examined through content analysis.

In the Time of India, 7 (30.43%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%)

(Geliş tarihi: 15.12.2020 – Kabul tarihi: 25.01.2021), DOI: 10.17932/IAU.IAUSBD.2021.021/iausbd_v13i2008

Araştırma Makalesi-Bu makale iThenticate programıyla kontrol edilmiştir.

Copyright © İstanbul Aydın Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi

unfavorable and 16 (69.56%) editorials were found neutral. In the Hindustan Times, 3 (21.42%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 11 (78.57%) editorials were found neutral. In Dawn, 7 (70%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 3 (30%) editorials were found neutral. In The Nation, 5 (50%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 5 (50%) editorials were found neutral. In total all four newspapers, 22 (38.59%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 35 (61.40%) editorials were found neutral.

Keywords: *Indian Muslims, Deteriorating Conditions, Indian Media, Coverage of Muslims, Modi*

HİNT MÜSLÜMANLARININ BELİRLEYİCİ ŞARTLARININ KAPSAMI ÜZERİNE PAKİSTAN VE HİNT İNGİLİZCE GÜNLÜK YAYINLARININ KARŞILAŞTIRMALI BİR ÇALIŞMASI

ÖZ

Bu araştırma, Hintli Müslümanların kötüleşen koşullarına ilişkin medyanın duruşunu / eğilimini ve büyüklüğünü incelemektedir. Hindistan'daki azınlıklar, özellikle Hintli Müslümanlar, hayatın her alanında kurumsal ve sistematik bir ön yargıya ve ihmallere katlanıyorlar. Hint anayasası tüm konularına eşit haklar vermesine rağmen, temel gerçeklik tamamen zıt bir hikâye anlatıyor. Hintli Müslümanlar, modern Hindistan'ın başlangıcından bu yana sayısız kez toplumsal şiddetin kurbanı oldular. Dahası, Modi'nin tahta çıkışından bu yana durum kötüleşti.

Bu çalışma için iki Hintli (Times of Indian & Hindustan Time) ve iki Pakistanlı (Dawn & The Nation) İngilizce gazete seçildi. Söz konusu gazetelerin altı aylık (11 Ağustos 2019 - 11 Şubat 2020) editöryel kapsamı içerik analizi yoluyla incelendi. Hintli Müslümanların kötüleşen koşulları hakkında yayınlanmış toplam 57 başyazı bulundu ve içerik analizi ile incelendi. Times of India'nın 23, Hindustan Times gazetesinin 14 ve Dawn ve The Nation'ın her birinin 10 yazısı basılmış ve incelenmiş olarak bulundu.

Time of India'da 7 (%30.43) yazı olumlu, 0 (%0.0) olumsuz ve 16 (%69.56) yazı tarafsız bulundu. Hindustan Times'da 3 (%21.42) yazı olumlu, 0 (%0.0) olumsuz ve 11 (%78.57) yazı tarafsız bulundu. Dawn'da 7 (%70) yazı olumlu, 0 (%0,0) olumsuz ve 3 (%30) yazı tarafsız bulundu. The Nation'da 5 (%50) yazı olumlu, 0 (%0,0) olumsuz, 5 (%50) yazı ise tarafsız bulundu. Toplamda dört gazetenin 22'si (%38.59) yazı olumlu, 0 (%0.0) olumsuz ve 35 (%61.40) yazı tarafsız bulundu.

Anahtar Kelimeler: *Hintli Müslümanlar, Kötüleşen Koşullar, Hint Medyası, Müslümanların Kapsamı, Modi*

INTRODUCTION

Since the partitions of India in 1947, Minorities, especially the Indian Muslims, are facing many challenges in all aspects of their lives. Though the Indian constitution gives equal rights to all minorities, but throughout the history of modern India, Communal violence, socio-economic injustices, institutional biases, and systematic neglect left behind the Indian Muslims in terms of education, social progress, financial wellbeing, and political representation as compared to other communities of the country. After the partition of India into the Hindu majority India and the Muslim majority Pakistan, India chose secularism and Pakistan became the Islamic Republic. Muhammad Ali Jinnah –the founder of Pakistan – famously said that Hindu and Muslims are different nations, based on their different cultures and religion mainly (Moore, 1983). However, millions of Indian Muslims gravitated towards the Indian National Congress (INC) party and did not opt to migrate to Pakistan. The upper-caste Hindus blame the ordinary Indian Muslims for the partition of their motherland, India. That’s why, the Indian Muslims faced communal violence, socio-economic injustices, institutional biases, and systematic neglect throughout the history of modern India and the majority population (Hindus) never tried to differentiate between the Muslim elite who created Pakistan and the millions of Indian Muslims [who] chose to remain in India and not migrate to Pakistan (Engineer, 2004).

Article 25, 29, and 30 of the Indian constitution bestow full rights to minorities and regard all citizens as equal subjects of the state. Therefore, because of the constitutional protection, Muslims in Indian are kept practicing their religion, language, and their way of life. Now, these constitutional provisions are regarded as a threat to Bharat Matha (India) by the ultra-Hindu fundamentalists. The Hindutva communalists always wanted to alter these constitutional provisions but they did not succeed but it entails a two-thirds majority in the Parliament to change the constitution (Engineer, 2004). However, after Modi’s ascension to the throne after winning a landslide election in 2014, this has changed, and he is now passing laws one after another that discriminate the Indian Muslims. The Citizenship (Amendment) Act (CAA), National Register of Citizens (NRC), and the revocation of article 370 are some vivid examples.

Media is a powerful tool in creating an image of any country, community, personality, business, etc. “It is based largely on journalism that we make up our national mind” (Zelizer & Allan 2002). The portrayal of Indian Muslims by the Indian media has played an instrumental role in creating their image in the masses. According to the research of past researches, the Hindi language media had portrayed the Indian Muslims negatively. However, the English media took

a more balanced and somewhat pro-Muslim stance (Narayana & Kapur, 2016). The purpose of this research was to examine the stance/slant and the magnitude of media coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. Two Indian (Times of Indian & Hindustan Time) and two Pakistani (Dawn & The Nation) English dailies were selected for this study based on their circulation and influence in public and the power corridors. The method of content analysis was castoff to fulfill the needs of the study. Six months (Aug 11, 2019, to Feb 11, 2020) of editorial coverage of the said dailies were examined through content analysis. Four months before the Citizenship (Amendment) Act (CAA), and two months after CAA.

A total of 57 editorials were found published about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims and were examined through content analysis. 23 editorials of Times of India, 14 of Hindustan Times, and 10 each of Dawn and The Nation were found published and examined through content analysis. In the Time of India, 7 (30.43%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 16 (69.56%) editorials were found neutral. In the Hindustan Times, 3 (21.42%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 11 (78.57%) editorials were found neutral. In Dawn, 7 (70%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 3 (30%) editorials were found neutral. In The Nation, 5 (50%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 5 (50%) editorials were found neutral. In total all four newspapers, 22 (38.59%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 35 (61.40%) editorials were found neutral.

COMMUNAL RIOTS

The first major communal riots took place in Jabalpur in 1962 (Engineer, 2004). The official numbers of the casualties are fifty-five but according to unofficial accounts, the death toll had reported more than 200 (Graff & Galonnier, 2013). These riots shocked the country and the First PM of India, Mr. Jawaherlal Nehru. He thought that the communal issue was resolved with partition. However, he did try to resolve the communal issue but did not live long and died in 1964. His daughter, Indira Gandhi, soon became the PM of India and tried to consolidate her party position by winning the hearts and minds of minorities through secularism. After all, before and after independence, minorities supported the National Congress Party because of the party's secular manifesto. Though, she eventually succeeded in her quest but also encountered prodigious hurdles. There was a big faction in the congress party that was opposed to her secular views. To weaken Indira Ji's position, they orchestrated communal riots in Ahmadabad in 1969 (Engineer, 2004). In total, these riots claimed 660 lives – 430 Muslims and 25 Hindus. According to other accounts, the death toll exceeded two thousand, and 80% of victims were Muslims (Graff & Galonnier, 2013).

In 1970, another holocaust happened in Bhivandi. According to reports, more than 400 people died in Bhivandi, mostly Muslims. Jansangh, a Hindu right-wing and communal outfit were instrumental in these riots (Engineer, 2004). In total, as per the Justice D. P. Madon Commission of Inquiry Report, 164 lives were lost. Among those killed, 142 were Muslims and 20 were Hindus (Graff & Galonnier, 2013).

In 1977, the newly formed Janata party won the elections and formed a government, and Jansangh was a constituent. Jansangh pledged its commitment to Gandhi Ji's secular ideology. Knowing that the Jansangh was complicit in several communal riots against minorities, especially Muslims, Muslims voted for the Janata party in desperation. They thought that Jansangh will reciprocate this gesture, but, they were soon disillusioned. After winning an election, a series of communal riots happened from 1978 onward. RSS (Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh) was not happy with Jansangh's pledge to secularism, so they engineered communal riots in Varanasi, Jamshedpur, and Aligarh et cetera, thus the Janata party government fell apart. Janata Party transformed into the Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) and they came to power in the 1980s. It was BJP that incited people to demolish Babri Masjid in 1992. Many communal riots happened either engineered by them or under their watch. Soon after Babri Masjid's demolition, communal riots happened in Delhi, Kanpur, Ahmedabad, Surat, Bombay et cetera. Gujarat massacred in 2002 was a huge blow to secular India. Thousands of Muslims were killed and women were rapped (Engineer, 2004).

SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONDITIONS

India is the biggest democracy in the world and has a population of 1.2 billion-plus. Because of the lack of political will [and systematic prejudice] minorities in India, especially Muslims, were left marginalized. Though many programs were initiated to uproot the problems and bring the Muslim community at par with the rest, but, the lack of will [and prejudice] didn't let the programs materialized (URL-22).

A seven-member committee spearheaded by Justice Rajinder Sachar (retired) was formed by the then Prime Minister of India Manmohan Singh to ascertain the educational, social, and economic condition of Indian Muslims, in 2005. The committee submitted its report in Nov 2006. The Sachar Report (SCR) is an expedient document on the educational, social, and economic conditions of Indian Muslims. The report divulges 60 years of institutional and systematic deprivation, prejudice, and neglect of Muslims in a complete and comprehensive way. This systematic and criminal neglect left behind the Muslims of India in terms of Education, social progress, financial wellbeing, and political representation as compared to other communities. The report does give its recommendations which

can play an instrumental role in uplifting the Muslim community if implemented vigorously and honestly. On the other hand, the right-wing Hindu political parties called the SCR a divisive ruse. However, they have to admit the vivid fact that indeed the Muslim community is the most deprived community of modern India (URL-18).

From time to time, here and there, we witnessed leaders condemning and criticizing the systematic deprivation of Muslims but there is not a single political party in India that raises Muslim grievances. For instance, Sharat Pawar denounced the religiously, ethnically, and racially motivated police arrests of Indian Muslims. Moreover, In February 2001, Ahmadabad High Court Judge vehemently criticized the state government for not issuing the notification of two criminal cases subsequent to the Babri Masjid incident (URL-8). A.G Noorani further argues the Indian Muslims grievances list is long and ranges from police biases, next to zero political representation, fewer job opportunities in both private and public sectors, communal biases in the educational syllabus, to the properties of the wakf. Both, the central and state-level governments failed to ensure equal rights and protection of the Indian Muslim community.

In the past 10 years, according to a report by Fact-Checkers, 76% of victims of hate crimes are Muslims. 90% of these hate crimes had happened since BJP won the 2014 2019 general elections. BJP is openly inciting Hindu youth to be cow protectors/vigilantes, which resulted in physical attacks on Muslims. A Muslim marrying a Hindu can cost them their lives. Furthermore, Muslims are being systematically targeted by the majority (Hindus) to undermine Indian Muslims and their marvelous history. Islamic historical infrastructure is being denigrated by BJP members and Modi himself. A right-wing member of BJP and Chief Minister of UP (Uttar Pradesh), Yogi Adityanath, said that the Taj Mahal, one of the 7 wonders of the world which was built by the Mughal ruler of India Shah Jahan, is not Indian, meaning that the style of the infrastructure is Islamic and Middle Eastern thus it doesn't belong to India. Iconic historical buildings, places, cities, and railway stations, named after famous Muslim historical figures are converted to Hindu names. Similarly, the content of textbooks has also been changed in the BJP ruled states of India (URL-21).

International Reports

According to the 2018 report of the U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom (USCIRF), "Conditions and atmosphere in India for religious minorities have deteriorated over the last decade owing to a multifaceted campaign by Hindu-nationalists... [Religious minorities] facing acts of violence, intimidation, loss of political power, and increasing feelings of "otherness" (URL-1). In 2017, during PM Modi's visit to the Whitehouse, a group of 5 U.S. senators wrote a letter to the

U.S. president to condemn the deteriorating conditions of minorities (religious) and to raise the matter with the Indian Prime Minister during his meeting. Though it is not vivid whether president Trump raised the issue during his meeting with Prime Minister Modi or not (URL-5).

The international human rights institutions and bodies kept producing reports one after another pertaining to the human rights situation in India. Even in some human rights violations, the state institutions are being founded accomplice. The State Department's Country Reports [on India] about the Human Rights Practices 2017, states: "The most significant human rights issues included police and security force abuses, such as extrajudicial killings, disappearances, torture, arbitrary arrest and detention, rape, harsh and life-threatening prison conditions, and lengthy pretrial detention. Widespread corruption; reports of political prisoners in certain states; and instances of censorship and harassment of media outlets, including some critical of the government continued (URL-2)."

In 2018, another report was issued by the Human Rights Watch (HRW), reporting the 2017 events in India and criticized Modi's government for increased vigilantism against minorities. The report states: "Dissent was labeled anti-national, and activists, journalists, and academics were targeted for their views, chilling free expression. Foreign funding regulations were used to target nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) critical of government actions or policies (URL-12)."

Amnesty International issued analogous kinds of concerns pertaining to the human rights violations against religious minorities, especially Muslims, under Modi's regime. According to the report, Muslims are demonized by the pro-government media, right-wing Hindu groups, and even by some state functionaries. Dalits are being targeted with impunity. Moreover, the state authorities encouraged violence against human rights activists and bodies critical of them. Freedom of expression in the media and on campuses deteriorated drastically. Furthermore, the report criticized even the higher courts of India. The report states: "The Supreme Court and High Courts delivered several progressive judgments, but some rulings undermined human rights. Impunity for human rights abuses persisted (URL-20)."

POLITICAL REPRESENTATION

Political representation is an essential indicator to measure the conditions of a community. A good political representation of a community is an indicator of empowerment. The Indian Muslims are the largest minority in Indian and have the third-largest Muslim population in the world after Indonesia and Pakistan. The Muslims of India are highly under-represented in the Indian 'Lok Sabah' and 'Rajya Sabha', the lower and upper house of the parliament respectively. The Indian Muslim's political representation is less than 50% of what it should

be as per their population. Apart from being an alienated community, the under-representation of Indian Muslims in the parliament [is a patent indicator of the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims] (Mainuddin, 2011).

Md Mainuddin (2011) further argues that the Indian Muslim community is under-represented in the national parliament and in the state level legislature as well. This issue has never been regarded as a problem in India. Unlike the schedule caste and schedule tribe, this issue needs a remedy. “On the eve of [the] elections, Muslims are often referred to as ‘pampered community’ and the government’s promises, though seldom fulfilled, are criticized as ‘minorityism’. The vitiated communal atmosphere poses more threat to the security of this minority community.”

The governments failed to address the issue of political marginalization of Muslims and to bring them into the decision making sphere through power-sharing (Mainuddin, 2011). The injustice and discrimination of Muslims in India in several socio-economic areas coincide with low political involvement. “Here again discrimination is seen in the non-inclusion of Muslims in the voter lists and the unfair delimitation exercises wherein Muslim majority constituencies are reserved for the SC category, even when the latter have higher population shares in other constituencies in the states. Consequently, Muslim candidates are not able to contest from Muslim concentrated area” (Basant, 2007).

MODI, HINDUTVA, RSS & INDIAN MUSLIMS

Narendra Modi & the Indian Muslims

After serving as chief minister of Gujarat state of India for almost 13 years, the incumbent Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi, a life member of RSS and leader of Hindu nationalist Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP), reached the top office of the country after winning general elections in 2014. He was denied a visa of the U.S. before while he was a chief minister on the allegations of playing an instrumental role in the massacre of Muslims in Gujarat. However, he later addressed the joint session of the U.S. Congress as the prime minister of India (URL-17).

Many congressmen praised the decision of denying him the U.S. visa in 2005. Later again upon Modi’s arrival in the United States in 2016, some congressmen publically criticized the Human rights violations in India (URL-14). Before the Gujarat massacre in 2001, Modi publically said that “All Muslims are not terrorists but all terrorists are Muslims” (Varadarajan, 2002). He kept using this phrase in his election campaigns and even after he became a CM of Gujarat. During the 2002 Gujarat bloodletting and mass rapes of Muslims, the local Gujarati media fueled the anti-Muslims hate, and Modi as a CM of Gujarat did nothing to quash the madness. For years he continued justifying the bloodletting and mass rapes of Muslims by arguing that the riots were a reaction to the Sabarmati Express

incident, which according to him the Sabarmati Express incident was done by Muslims – keeping in mind that his claims came before the police investigations. Later during “Gaurav Yatra” which he organized to invoke the Gujarati pride, he accused the secularists of reportedly accusing the whole population of the Gujarat state as mass murderers (URL-8).

He continued to demonize Muslims in his electoral campaigns. Many Muslims fall victims to the police brutality and killings under his watch. The home minister of Gujarat, Amit Shah, and other police officers was found involved in the incidents in the investigations (Engineer, 2015). Instead of improvement, the condition of Indian Muslims has gone worse from bad since the inception of modern India. With the Rashtriya Swayamsewak Sangh (RSS) is in control of helm under the leadership of RSS life member Narendra Modi, by and large, the conditions of Indian Muslims are deteriorating all over India. There is not a signal elected Muslim parliamentarian from the BJP’s - the RSS political front - ruled states (URL-8).

BJP won state-level elections in 2017 in Uttar Pradesh (UP), the most populated state of India with 200 million inhabitants, one-fifth of them are Muslims. BJP appointed Yogi Adityanath as chief minister of UP, a hardliner, under Modi’s umbrella. The appointment of a hardliner Hindu cleric dazed the political pundits and rattled not only the biggest two minority groups, Muslims and Christians, but other minority groups as well (URL-19). Though communal and sectarian violence is not new to India, but, Hindu prejudice and chauvinism increased rapidly since Modi’s BJP seized the central throne, and his party gained state-level power (URL-10). Muslims are being targeted by the hardliner Hindu mobs. In Gurgaon, Hindus unleashed a harsh campaign against Muslims offering prayers in the open spaces. Rajeev Mittal, the leader of the Hindus group who started the campaign against Muslims contended that their campaign is not against worshippers but rather about upholding the local municipal laws. He further said: “We are not against people offering prayer, but it should be done in the mosque or in all the areas designated for them (URL-6).”

The lynching of Indian Muslims drastically increased in India under Modi’s regime. [To mention a few] Soon after Modi’s second general elections victory in 2019, a video had been surfaced on Social media showing a Muslim man, Tabrez Ansari, 22, lynched by a Hindu mob, in the state of Jharkhand. The mob coerced him to raise slogans such as “Jai Shri Ram” which means “Hail Shri Ram”. Later, Tabrez Ansari succumbed to his wounds in the hospital. In another incident, a school teacher was arrested by the police of Jharkhand for defending beef eaters in a 2-year-old social media post. Another school teacher was thrown out of a running train in Kolkata for rebuffing to shout Hindu slogans (URL-11).

In April 2017, Irshad Khan along with his brother, Arif, and father, Pehlu, hails from Jaishingpur village, was attacked by an angry mob while they were carrying cows in their truck from Jaipur to their Village. Later, his father succumbed to his injuries in the hospital (URL-13). On 28 Sep 2015, in Dadri, Neighbors accused Muhammad Akhlaq and his family of eating beef. The violent Hindu mob dragged them all out of their house and brutally assaulted them. Before the arrival of police, Akhlaq succumbed to his injuries, and his son was critically injured as well. Later in an investigation, the police found that the meat that was found in Akhlaq's house was Mutton not beef, and a local BJP political leader's son was found complicit in the lynching (Sarkar, 2016). [The list goes on].

In his review of Komireddi's Book 'Malevolent Republic: A Short History of the New India' in The Guardian newspaper, Mr. Jason Burke wrote that "Though the book was written before the polls in 2019, but the author, an Indian journalist, has no doubts about the rupture that Modi represents with all that has gone before." Then he quoted Komireddi that: "India under Modi has undergone the most total transformation since 1991 [when the economy was opened up to the free market and an astonishing boom unleashed]... the New India he has spawned... is a reflection of its progenitor: culturally arid, intellectually vacant, emotionally bruised, vain, bitter, boastful, permanently aggrieved and implacably malevolent: a make-believe land full of fudge and fakery, where savagery against religious minorities is among the therapeutic options available to a self-pitying majority frustrated by Modi's failure to upgrade its standard of living" (URL-15).

Winning a landslide victory in the 2019 general elections, Modi with absolute powers is passing laws from the parliament one after another – which in one way or another discriminate against Muslims. Among these laws, NRC is one of them. NRC was predominantly implemented in Assam to identify Muslim migrants, mainly from Bangladesh, and as a result of this exercise, 2 million folks were declared alien and illegal migrants. The BJP regime pledged that once they are done with Assam, NRC will be implemented in the rest of India as well. But, the exercise went wrong for the right-wing Hindu supremacist BJP because 60% were Hindus among those who failed to produce papers, therefore, identified illegal migrants. So, to corner Muslims alone and exclude Hindus, Sikhs, Buddhists, Jains, Christians, and Parsis, they had passed the notorious and draconian law, called the Citizenship Amendment Act (CAA) (URL-16). One of BJP's manifesto promises is to expel, delete, and eliminate the illegal Bengali Muslim migrants. During an election campaign, the incumbent home minister of India, Amit Shah, called these migrants "infiltrators" and "termites" (Rajini, 2019).

Hindutva & the Indian Muslims

Before the East India company occupation of India in 1857, Muslims ruled India

for approximately 950 years. A plethora of right-wing Hindu nationalists and few historians believe that Hindus and Hindu culture, religion, and way of life were suppressed during the Muslim rule. Therefore, with the rise of the independence movement in India, the aspiration of Hindus grew to fix this historic bent.

The term Hindu fundamentalist is not the right word for describing Hindutva. Because there is no holy scripture in Hinduism to which obedience and conformity can be ordered or called. The Hindutva term was first used by Savarkar's in 1923. Vinayak Savarkar was a Hindu nationalist and politician. According to him, Hindutva itself is a whole history, instead of calling it a word. He believed that it is not only a religious or cultural history of Hindus but it encompasses everything. According to Savarkar, the Hindu religion is just a part of Hindutva (Savarkar's book: Essentials of Hindutva, 1923).

According to another scholar Arun Swamy, "Defining India's diversity along linguistic, regional, and caste lines as a 'Hindu culture' is problematic" (URL-4). For BJP and other political parties, Hinduism as an idea is parallel to nationalism. According to them, the fundamental idea is that the land of India is inherently Hindu. Therefore, they conceive Islam and Christianity a foreign invading religions/cultures and deems them a threat to the Hindu nation (Jaffrelot, 1996) (Swamy, 2003).

The following are the characteristics of Hindutva in nutshell. A) India is the inherent land of Hindus, thus they are the licit and rightful rulers of this land. B) Because the origin of Islam and Christianity is not Indian and indigenous. Muslims and Christians are seen with mixed feelings and doubts. C) The caste system is a threat to Hindu unity. Predominantly, Modi's and his BJP party politics revolve around the Hindutva ideology. As per the UNCIRF, Hindutva excludes all others except Hindus and only focuses on Hindus' rights (URL-1).

RSS (Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh)

RSS (Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh) is the Hindu supremacist and violent organization that assassinated the great Mahatma Gandhi on Jan 30, 1948. RSS (Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh) strictly follows the Hindutva ideology. The Hindutva and Hindu nationalism ideologies have evolved from Savarkar's views. Vinayak Savarkar was a Hindu nationalist and politician. He wrote in a 1923 treatise: "Mohammedan [Muslim] or Christian countrymen ... are not and cannot be recognized as Hindus, their holy land is far off in Arabia or Palestine. Their mythology and godmen, ideas, and heroes are not children of this soil (URL-6)."

Bajrang Dal is their wing that recruits foot soldiers for them and deploys them in groups across the country to target Muslims and other minorities. They have created and deployed more than 25,000 groups across India. According to Paul Richard Brass, a professor at the University of Washington, Bajrang Dal is "a

somewhat pathetic but nevertheless dangerous version of the Nazi S.A.” Since Bajrang Dal’s creation, for much of the years, they have been remained on the margins in Indian society and never came to the mainstream. But since Modi’s assertion into the throne in 2014, RSS and Bajrang Dal have grown manifold and have been legitimized. As a consequence, communal violence increased by 28% between 2014-2017 (URL-13).

CITIZEN AMENDMENT ACT (CAA)

On 12th December 2019, a Citizen Amendment Act (CAA) has been passed by the BJP government from the parliament which gives the right to all religions to claim citizenship of India, fleeing persecution from Muslim majority neighboring countries (namely Afghanistan, Pakistan, and Bangladesh), but except Muslims. The CAA streamlines the citizenship process for the religious minorities (except Muslims) and allows them to claim Indian citizenship in six years. Hitherto, 12 years of stay within India is the prerequisite for Naturalization. The federal government argues that the bill is for the protection of minorities fleeing persecution from the above-said countries. However, these claims are deeply flawed, because this law doesn’t include Ahmadi Muslims from Pakistan, Hindus & Christians from Sir Lanka, and Muslims & Hindus from Myanmar. The CAA will not come into effect in the autonomous regions of India – under the sixth schedule of the Indian Constitution. These autonomous tribal denominated regions are Tripura and Mizoram, Assam, Meghalaya. The Act will also not apply to Nagaland and Mizoram and Arunachal Pradesh. (URL-3).

MEDIA & INDIAN MUSLIMS

The bond between media and minorities is an ongoing struggle that those who acquaint the anecdote. Agenda-setting is one of the most expedient functions of media. It is the media that tells the mass what’s essential and what’s not. Agenda-setting was first introduced by Bernard Cohen. He said: “The press may not be successful much of the time in telling people how to think, but it is stunningly successful in telling its readers what to think.” For the last two decades, Muslims, Arabs, and the Middle East are the prime focus of media. This started with the gulf war and continued with events such as the 9/11, Afghanistan invasion, Iraq invasion, the Arab spring et cetera (Azharudeen, 2016).

Media is a powerful tool in creating an image of any country, community, personality, business, etc. “It is based largely on journalism that we make up our national mind” (Zelizer & Allan 2002). The portrayal of a certain type of community or religion, race, and ethnicity by the media has been the main interest of academics for ages. Muslims are perceived negatively all over the world, especially after 9/11, and the media played an instrumental role in creating this image. Moreover, the Muslim community is the biggest minority community

in India [well over more than 180 million] and patently Hindus are in majority in India. With her secular constitution, which ensures minorities equal rights, India is the world's biggest democracy and has vibrant media, which played an instrumental role in constructing the image of Muslims [they have] in India (Narayana & Kapur, 2016).

The print media of India is diverse in its disposition in terms of languages and dialects. It has a huge circulation in the country, not only in the regional languages, such as Gujarati, Marathi, Tamil and Urdu, but English as well. Furthermore, the Hindi language newspapers have the biggest circulation whereas English dailies fall into the second category however the Urdu language dailies have a very small number of circulations in the country. Gujarati and Marathi language newspapers are regional dailies and have a huge number of publications. Nevertheless, Marathi, Hindi, and Gujarati media are more insensitive towards Muslims [than the English media]. The regional language dailies are more influenced by Hindutva and BJP's doctrine [than the English print media] (Farouqui, 2009).

Modern-day India's history is littered with communal riots such as the Babri Masjid incident, which happened on 6 Dec 1992. With the covert and silent concurrence of the Indian government, the Hindu communalists demolished the Babri Masjid. The Hindi-language media labeled Muslims as "terrorists and fundamentalists" and the media supported the Hindu Mobs and portrayed their opinion as to the opinion of the Indian masses. The same anecdote had been repeated in the Gujarat riots in 2002 as far as the Hindi-language media is a concern. However, the English media took a more balanced (Narayana & Kapur, 2016).

According to senior journalists of India, the Indian media is demonizing the largest minority of the country, Muslims (180 million). They are exhibiting Muslims as disloyal to the state of India and a regressive community. Furthermore, Muslims are being called anti-nationals on TV shows. According to Paranjay Guha Thakurta, author and independent journalist, a segment of Indian media added hugely to the increasing intolerance in India. This section of media tried to exhibit minorities, especially Muslims, as second class citizens of the country. This is the kind of Islamophobia that is being metastasized. He further named the TV hosts that hugely added to the high level of toxicity in the Indian society, they include "Anjana Om Kashyap of Aaj Tak, Sudhir Chaudhary of Zee News, Amish Devgun of Network 18 Hindi and Gaurav Sawant of India Today TV (URL-9) Arnab Goswami and list goes on.

These media outlets claim to have an internal system of blocking inciting and provocative content but records prove that these claims all just claims. For instance, Suresh Chavhanke appeared on his own Sudarshan TV and said: "conspiracy to

turn India into an Islamic country.” A managing editor of NDTV India, Ravish Kumar, argues that the Indian mainstream media outlets are undermining the Indian democracy and their numbers are in hundreds. By covering issues such as the Ram temple, these channels pretended of protecting the interest of Hindus. According to him, the Indian media is deliberately making Hindus insecure of Muslims and by doing so they are converting Hindus into a [violent] mob. He continues, adding that: “Today’s media has become a Hindu media and they don’t follow ideals of journalism. I say to Hindus to stop watching news channels (URL-9).”

In 2019, the Modi government revoked the especial Status (Article 370) of Indian administered Jammu & Kashmir (J&K). In addition, during his state visit to Washington in 2019, he met with members of the Kashmiri Pandit community. Kashmiri Pandits was a Hindu minority in J&K and was driven out from the valley in 1990 by force. Their numbers were estimated at around 350,000. The mainstream media and social media is fabricating an impression that the abrogation of 370 is vengeance for killing and driving out the Hindu Pandit community from the Valley (URL-7).

PROBLEM STATEMENT

Media is a powerful tool in creating an image of any country, community, personality, business, and et cetera. “It is based largely on journalism that we make up our national mind” (Zelizer & Allan 2002). During the Babri Masjid Incident, the Hindi-language media labeled Muslims as “terrorists and fundamentalists” and the media supported the Hindu Mobs and portrayed their opinion as to the opinion of the Indian masses. The same anecdote had been repeated in the Gujarat riots in 2002. However, the Indian English media, by and large, took a somewhat balanced stance (Narayana & Kapur, 2016). The Pakistani English press might be low in circulation compared to Urdu dailies but it’s extremely influential in Pakistan’s power corridors (Ali, 2017). In the past, several studies have been conducted about the Indian media portrayal of Indian Muslims. But, no study has been conducted yet that examines the stance/slant and the amount of coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims by the Pakistani & Indian English press in their editorials. This study will examine the Stance/slant of the Pakistani & Indian English press to ascertain whether its coverage of the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims is Favorable, Unfavorable, or Neutral. Secondly, it examines the magnitude of coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in their editorials.

RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

1:- To examine the stance/slant of the Pakistani & Indian English press, by studying their editorials, to ascertain whether their coverage of the deteriorating

conditions of Indian Muslims is Favorable, Unfavorable, or Neutral.

2:- To study the magnitude of coverage given by the Pakistani & Indian English press to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in their editorials.

SIGNIFICANCE OF RESEARCH

In the past, several studies have been conducted to study the portrayal of Indian Muslims by the Indian media. However, no study has been conducted yet that examines the stance/slant and the amount of coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims by the Pakistani & Indian English press. Through content analysis of its editorials, this study will analyze the stance of two Indian English dailies (Times of India & Hindustan Times) and two Pakistani English newspapers (Dawn & The Nation) regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims and the amount of coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims.

This study has been conducted during an imported time in the history of Indian Muslims. The incumbent prime minister of India, Narendra Modi (life member of RSS), had played an instrumental role in the Gujarat massacre of Muslims and the demolition of the 12-century mosque, the eminent Babri Masjid when he was a chief minister of Gujarat. Now as a prime minister of the country, he is passing anti-Muslims laws (CAA, NRC, Abrogation of article 370) one after another and the mobs of RSS are lynching Muslims in broad daylight with impunity. Muslims are being systematically harassed and deprived of their rights, socially, educationally, religiously, institutionally, and politically. In reaction, the entire Muslim community and the secular non-Muslims of India are protesting across the country. Ergo, this study is very timely and significant.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The focus of this research is on the stance and coverage of the Pakistani & India press pertaining to the deteriorating conditions of India Muslims. In this section, the existing literature has been reviewed regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims and their portrayal in the media.

Deteriorating Conditions of Indian Muslims

Basant (2007) discusses the seven-member Sachar committee spearheaded by Justice (retired) Rajinder Sachar which was formed by the then Prime minister of India Manmohan Singh to ascertain the educational, social, and economic condition of Indian Muslims, in 2005. The committee submitted its report in Nov 2006. The Sachar Report (SCR) is the first attempt of its kind to render information on the social and economic conditions of Indian Muslims by using large-scale empirical data. The report divulges 60 years of institutional and systematic deprivation, prejudice, and neglect of Muslims. Furthermore,

the report also gives its recommendations to uplift the Muslim community if implemented vigorously and honestly.

Mainuddin (2011) analyzed the socio-economic conditions of Indian Muslims, mainly of West Bengal, through secondary data. The objectives of the study were to ascertain the socio-economic conditions of Indian Muslims to understand the plight of the Muslim community. According to his study findings, socio-politically and socio-economically the Indian Muslims are the most marginalized community of India. Their conditions are not at par with the rest of the communities and deteriorated in all walks of life.

Majid and Farooq (2019) concluded in their study that since the inception of modern India, the Muslim community has been kept deprived, and the Indian constitutions failed to function and address the disquiets of the Muslim community. The majority [Hindus] and the even government of India made loathing and prejudice towards Muslims a common practice in daily routine life, and on the other hand, the policymakers of the country also ignored the community. Muslims and Christians become targets of Modi's hate and warmongering activities and the international community also did not take notice of it.

Mistry (2006) discussed the socio-economic situation of Muslims in great detail. In the study, Mistry concluded that since 1947, Muslims of India have failed to progress socially and economically. However, there are a plethora of instances of individual achievements of Muslims contributing to all spheres of the Indian state. According to Kutty (2007), there is no scarcity of organizations created with the agendas to advance the interests of the Muslim community. However, for the achievement of sustainable growth of the Muslim community is important to enable them to set their own agendas and function in the society proactively instead of reacting to the agendas set by their rivals for them.

Alam (URL-22), in his study "Democracy and Indian Muslims as Unequal", analyzed the problems and prospects of Indian democracy in the context of minority Muslim rights. He concluded that in every walk of life the Indian Muslims' conditions are worsened. He noted: "The community needs special safeguards from the government and non-government institutions at-least to minimize such violence." Furthermore, Alam (URL-22) in his article "Democracy Democracy and Indian Muslims Living In Peril and Indian Muslims Living In Peril", concluded similar type of problems as far as the Muslim community treatment is a concern, that no democracy and pluralistic society can function properly by systematically neglecting its minority communities.

Jaffrelot (2017) discusses the situation of Indian democracy and the growing violence against minority groups in his study. He stated in his article that by-and-large the constitution remained secular and India is the world's biggest

democracy but in practice, especially after 2014, minorities are facing a new kind of domination. Despite the official secular narrative of the state, the country's ruling leaders openly supporting Hindutva and support the policing of Muslims and Christians by the right-wing Hindus [RSS]. According to the 2011 census, Muslims are 14% of the total population of India, yet only 3.7% of members of the parliament are Muslims. Furthermore, 21% of prisoners awaiting trial are Muslims. "Yet the Muslim share of those sentenced in 2015 (15.8 percent) is nearly the same as the proportion of Muslims in the general population, a sign that many of those arrested are cleared at trial." The justice system of India is extremely slow and that means a long prison term if being arrested by the police. He concluded that India is slowly becoming an 'ethnic democracy'.

Koushik (2013), by studying the "public theologies and their substantive, spatial, spiritual and temporal dimensions" concluded that despite the high level of protection in the constitution for minorities, Muslims of India are considered 'others' and they are categorized as 'Good and Bad Muslims'. Muslims are required to prove their loyalty to the state. Adcock (2018), by reviewing the reports issued by the U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom and by the U.S. Department of State's Office of International Religious Freedom, with regards to the cow protectionists issue, she concluded that the politics of cow protection and anti-slaughter legislation further deteriorated the conditions of Muslims and it puts the goal of curtailing anti-minority bigotry and violence in jeopardy.

Sajjad (2018), analyzed the deteriorating conditions of Muslims since Modi's BJP came to power in 2014 through different recent sources and Human rights reports of international organizations. He concluded that the conditions of Muslims deteriorated drastically under the BJP government. Since 2014, Muslims and other minorities have faced persecution which is centered on communal issues. It is argued that right-wing forces of Hindutva with the ideological support of the BJP have encouraged radical mindsets and ingrained them in Indian society. This signifies that even seemingly "secular" political representatives of the Congress party have reinstated forms of Hindu supremacy in the ambiance where history is being edited and minority communities are portrayed as aliens in the Republic of India.

Portrayal of Indian Muslims by the Indian Media

Narayana & Kapur's (2011) content analysis of three elite Indian English dailies reveals that most of the news content was based on news reports and most of these reports were based on press releases and speeches of politicians. The findings of this study denote that the mainstream Indian media are seldomly cover matters that are important and pertinent to the Indian Muslim community. Furthermore,

Space given to Muslim issues in the Indian mainstream media is far from being satisfactory. The Indian mainstream media do not have any policy of news treatment of the Indian Muslim community.

Afaq's (2015) study of two national newspapers of India was to ascertain the tone of newspapers regarding Indian Muslims reveals that the negative portrayal of the Muslim community by the mainstream media has dangerous repercussions and this might put the Muslim community in a disadvantageous position. His analysis of the 'Time of India' and 'The Hindu' clearly shows that these two English mainstream newspapers portrayed the Muslim community very negatively. "Often Muslims are portrayed as terrorists, anti-nationals, communal, fundamentalists, etc."

Liyakat's (2017) study analyzes the "Image of Muslims in Mainstream English Dailies of India, during 2007 and 2017." The study uncovers that because of the media's negative projection of Indian Muslims they are often perceived as anti-nationals, terrorists, communal, fundamentalists, zealots, etc. His analysis reveals that the proportion of negative coverage given to Muslims was very high as compared to the positive coverage.

Ahmed (2016) examines the portrayal of Muslims and Islam by the Tamil media. In his content analysis of four Tamil dailies, namely Dinakaran, Dinamalar, Dinamani, and Dina Thanthi concludes that after the Coimbatore bombing Tamil media represented Muslims as suspicious and terrorist and created a negative impression of Islam and Muslims among the masses. The "terms like Muslim theeviravadhigal, Islamia payangaravadhigal, theeviravadhigal, jihad poraligal and adipadaivadhigal are used extensively in the Tamil dailies" which created a negative image of Islam and Muslims. Kumar (2011) analyzes the mainstream print media coverage given to the rape cases of Muslim women. "Generally, Muslims are underrepresented between the experts, newsmakers, and people portrayed by the media. When they get heed by the media, they are more apt to be represented as villains."

Bhat, Iqbal, and Akhtar's (2017) study revealed the systematic negative representation of Muslims by the Indian media. This negative portrayal of Muslims and Islam pushed the community to the margin of Indian society. This trend did and will alienate them further. "The risk of creating social outcasts is seen as a great challenge to the long-term cohesion of society." The media has unleashed a campaign against the Muslim community and Islam and Muslims in the grab of a campaign against terrorism. According to Nurullah (2010), the Media represented Islam and Muslims as terrorists and Fundamentalists. Moreover, the media associated terrorism with Muslims and called it their sole monopoly. Such attribution resulted in racial hatred, Islamophobia, attacks on Muslims minorities,

pogroms, and all kinds of other violence.

Kattarwala (2010) concluded that on one side, the depiction is those of a secular and of unity which help melting the tensions between the two faiths. And on the other side, there is a division which strengthen the inherently patently distinct identity of Islam and Hinduism and regard Islam as the faith of outsiders. Ahmed (2010) analyzed the Indian media coverage of communal riots. He concluded that with the passage of time the mainstream media improved their coverage of such riots but the regional media followed their Hindutva agendas and fueled tensions between Hindus and Muslims during Gujarat and other-riots.

METHODOLOGY

Research Methodology

This is a comparative study of two Pakistani English dailies (Dawn & The Nation) and two Indian English dailies (Times of India & Hindustan Times). The dailies were selected on the basis of their circulation and influence in public and in the power corridors. Total six months (four before CAA and two after CAA) of editorials of all four dailies were examined to ascertain the stance/slant of the newspapers and the amount of coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims (from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020). The method of content analysis was castoff to [examine] the editorials of the dailies (Sarantakos, 2012). The unit of analysis of this study was the paragraph of the editorials and the whole editorials of the above-mentioned dailies. All the editorials regarding Indian Muslims of the above mentioned four newspapers from Aug 11, 2019 to Feb 11, 2020 were deemed as the universe of this research. All editorials of the above said newspapers about Indian Muslims were selected as samples for this study. Four categories were designated to ascertain the Stance/Slant & magnitude of coverage given to the Indian Muslims, Favorable, Unfavorable, Neutral, and Magnitude of Coverage.

RESULTS

The aim of this chapter is to summarize and evaluate the finds of the content analysis of four different newspaper editorials to study the slant and the magnitude of the coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. Four different newspaper editorials were examined from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Among the four different newspapers, two Indian English dailies (Times of India & Hindustan Times) were selected and two Pakistani English dailies were selected for the study.

Table 1. Times of India. Table by Paragraphs from Aug 11, 2019 to Feb 11, 2020

	Total Paragraphs in editorial	Favorable Para- graphs	Unfavorable Paragraphs	Neutral Para- graphs	Overall editorial Slant
Feb 7, 2020	4 100%	2 50%	0 0.0%	2 50%	Neutral
Feb 5, 2020	4 100%	1 25%	0 0.0%	3 75%	Neutral
Feb 4, 2020	4 100%	0 0.0%	1 25%	3 75%	Neutral
Feb 3, 2020	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Feb 1, 2020	3 100%	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Jan 30, 2020	4 100%	3 75%	0 0.0%	1 25%	Favorable
Jan 24, 2020	4 100%	2 50%	0 0.0%	2 50%	Neutral
Jan 11, 2020	3 100%	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Jan 3, 2020	4 100%	2 50%	0 0.0%	2 50%	Neutral
Dec 30, 2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Dec 26, 2019	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	3 100%	Neutral
Dec 24, 2019	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	3 100%	Neutral
Dec 20, 2019	4 100%	1 25%	0 0.0%	3 75%	Neutral
Dec 17, 2019	4 100%	1 25%	0 0.0%	3 75%	Neutral
Dec 12, 2019	3 100%	2 66.66%	0 0.0%	1 33.33%	Favorable
Dec 10, 2019	3 100%	2 66.66%	0 0.0%	1 33.33%	Favorable
Dec 9, 2019	4 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	4 100%	Neutral
Nov 21, 2019	3 100%	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Nov 20, 2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Oct 18, 2019	4 100%	1 25%	0 0.0%	3 75%	Neutral
Sep 20, 2019	3 100%	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Sep 18, 2019	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	3 100%	Neutral
Sep 16, 2019	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	3 100%	Neutral
Total	79 2,300%	29 958.31%	1 25%	46 1,316.64%	

Table 1 (Check *Figure 1* for the illustration) shows the total number of editorials published pertaining to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in the Time of India from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Also, it shows the slant of the editorials about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims published in the Time of India from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Total 79 paragraphs in 23 editorials were published regarding the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims in the Times of India. 29 (36.70%) paragraphs were found favorable in terms of slant, 1 (1.26%) paragraphs unfavorable and 46 (58.22%) paragraphs were found neutral.

Table 2. Hindustan Times. Table by paragraph from Aug 11, 2019 to Feb 11, 2020

	Total Para- graphs in edi- torial	Favorable Paragraphs	Unfavorable Paragraphs	Neutral Para- graphs	Overall edito- rial Slant
Feb 11, 2020	3 100%	2 66.66%	0 0.0%	1 33.33%	Favorable
Jan 28, 2020	3 100%	2 66.66%	0 0.0%	1 33.33%	Favorable
Jan 10, 2020	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Jan 7, 2020	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Dec 18, 2019	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	3 100%	Neutral
Dec 18, 2019	3 100%	2 66.66%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Dec 17, 2020	5 100%	2 40%	0 0.0%	3 60%	Neutral
Nov 14, 2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Nov 6, 2019	6 100%	1 16.66%	0 0.0%	5 83.33%	Neutral
Nov 7, 2019	4 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	4 100%	Neutral
Oct 30, 2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Oct 16, 2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Oct 6, 2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Sep 6, 2020	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	3 100%	Neutral
	48 1,400%	15 456.62%	1 33.33%	32 909.95%	

Table 2 (Check *Figure 2* for the illustration) shows the total number of editorials published pertaining to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in Hindustan Times from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Also, it shows the slant of the editorials about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims published in the Hindustan Times from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Total 48 paragraphs in 14 editorials were published regarding the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims in the Hindustan Times. 15 (31.25%) editorials were found favorable in terms of slant, 1 (2.08%) paragraphs unfavorable and 32 (66.66%) paragraphs were found neutral.

Table 3. Daily Dawn. Tables by paragraphs from Aug 11, 2019 to Feb 11, 2020

	Total Para- graphs in editorial	Favorable paragraphs	Unfavorable paragraphs	Neutral paragraphs	Overall edi- torial Slant
Jan 7, 2020	2 100%	2 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Dec 13, 2019	2 100%	2 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Dec 12, 2019	6 100%	5 20%	0 0.0%	1 80%	Favorable
Nov 10, 2019	6 100%	4 66.66%	0 0.0%	2 33.33%	Favorable
Nov 18, 2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Oct 6, 2019	12 100%	1 8.33%	0 0.0%	11 91.66%	Neutral
Oct 8, 2019	2 100%	2 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Sep 3, 2019	9 100%	2 22.22%	0 0.0%	7 77.77%	Neutral
Aug 17, 2019	3 100%	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
	45 900%	22 550.54	0 0.0%	23 349.42%	

Table 3 (Check *Figure 3* for the illustration) shows the total number of editorials published pertaining to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in Dawn from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Also, it shows the slant of the editorials about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims published in Dawn from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Total 45 paragraphs in 10 editorials were published regarding the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims in Dawn. 22

(48.88%) paragraphs were found favorable in terms of slant, 0 (0.0%) paragraphs unfavorable and 23 (51.11%) paragraphs were found neutral.

Table 4. The Nation. Table by paragraph from Aug 11, 2019 to Feb 11, 2020

	Total Paragraphs in editorial	Favorable paragraphs	Unfavorable paragraphs	Neutral paragraphs	Overall editorial Slant
Feb 5, 2020	9 100%	6 66.66%	0 0.0%	3 33.33%	Favorable
Jan 11, 2020	4 100%	4 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Jan 5, 2020	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Dec 21,2019	3 100%	3 100%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	Favorable
Dec 18,2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Dec 17,2019	5 100%	1 20%	0 0.0%	4 80%	Neutral
Dec 14,2019	2 100%	1 50%	0 0.0%	1 50%	Neutral
Dec 11,2019	3 100%	1 33.33%	0 0.0%	2 66.66%	Neutral
Nov10,2019	4 100%	3 75%	0 0.0%	1 25%	Favorable
Oct 5, 2019	3 100%	2 66.66%	0 0.0%	1 33.33%	Favorable
	39 1000%	23 578.31%	0 0.0%	16 421.64%	

Table 4 (Check *Figure 4* for the illustration) shows the total number of editorials published pertaining to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in The Nation from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Also, it shows the slant of the editorials about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims published in The Nation from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020. Total 39 paragraphs in 10 editorials were published regarding the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims in The Nation. 23 (58.97%) paragraphs were found favorable in terms of slant, 0 (0.0%) paragraphs unfavorable and 16 (41.02%) paragraphs were found neutral.

Table 5. Slant & Magnitude distribution by newspapers from Aug 11, 2019 to Feb 11, 2020

	Favorable	Unfavorable	Neutral	Total
Times Of India	7 30.43%	0 0.0%	16 69.56%	23 100%
Hindustan Time Dawn	3 21.42%	0 0.0%	11 78.57%	14 100%
The Nation	7 70%	0 0.0%	3 30%	10 100%
	5 50%	0 0.0%	5 50%	10 100%
Total	22 171.85%	0 0.0%	35 228.13%	57 400%

Table 5 (Check *Figure 5* for the illustration) shows the total amount of editorial published regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in all four newspapers and in each newspaper. Also it shows the slant of each newspaper and all four newspapers together. **Times of India:** Total 23 editorials were published in the Times of India. 7 (30.43%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 16 (69.56%) editorials were found neutral. **Hindustan Times:** Total 14 editorials were published in Hindustan Times. 3 (21.42% editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 11 (78.57%) editorials were found neutral. **Daily Dawn:** Total 10 editorials were published in Dawn. 7 (70%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 3 (30%) editorials were found neutral. **The Nation:** Total 10 editorials were published in The Nation. 5 (50%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 5 (50%) editorials were found neutral. **Total:** Total 57 editorials were published all together in four different newspapers. 22 (38.59%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 35 (61.40%) editorials were found neutral.

DISCUSSION AND ANALYSIS

In the discussion and analysis chapter, the results or findings are discussed and analyzed in terms of the research objectives. This content analysis study aimed to analyze, compare and examine four different newspapers (two Pakistani and two Indian English dailies) by studying their editorials to ascertain the stance/slant of the newspapers regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. The research also aims to study the magnitude of the coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims.

TIMES OF INDIA SLANT & MAGNITUDE

Six months of editorials (August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020) of the Times of India were analyzed to ascertain the slant and magnitude of the daily's coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. As demonstrated by *Table 4.1*, 23 editorials (Total 79 paragraphs) were published by the daily regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. This indicates that the daily's coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims was fairly good and was neither low nor high. Thus, the result shows that the magnitude of coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims by the Times of India was good and highest of all.

With regards to the stance/slant of the daily pertaining to the coverage given to the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims, out of the 79 paragraphs of the total 23 editorials, 29 paragraphs were favorable, only 1 was unfavorable, and 46 paragraphs were found neutral. So, according to the results, the daily's stance/slant was neutral and favorable. Except one paragraph, no unfavorable paragraphs were found by the study in the daily's coverage about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. This indicates that the daily either favored Muslims or produced neutral analysis on the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. However, the daily's analysis was predominantly neutral in its stance/slant.

HINDUSTAN TIMES SLANT & MAGNITUDE

The Hindustan Times editorials from August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020 (Six months) were analyzed to ascertain the stance/slant and magnitude of the daily's coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. As demonstrated by *Table 4.2*, 14 editorials (Total 48 paragraphs) were published by the daily regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. The result indicates that the magnitude of the daily's coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims was average.

Pertaining to the stance/slant of the daily regarding its coverage given to the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims, out of the 48 paragraphs of the total 14 editorials, 15 paragraphs were favorable, only 1 was unfavorable, and 32 paragraphs were found neutral. So, according to the results, the stance/slant of the daily was found predominantly neutral and fairly favorable. Except one paragraph, no unfavorable paragraphs were found by the study in the daily's coverage about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. This indicates that the coverage produced by the daily was not only predominantly neutral but also favored the Indian Muslims.

DAILY DAWN SLANT & MAGNITUDE

The study investigated six months of editorials (August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020) of the Daily Dawn to ascertain the slant and magnitude of the daily's

coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. As demonstrated by *Table 4.3*, 10 editorials (Total 45 paragraphs) were published by the daily regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. This indicates that the daily's coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in terms of total paragraphs published by the daily is ahead of The Nation. Therefore, the result shows that the magnitude of coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims by Daily Dawn is higher than The Nation in terms of total paragraphs count.

With regards to the stance/slant of the daily regards the coverage given to the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims, out of the 45 paragraphs of the total 10 editorials, 22 paragraphs were favorable, 0 was unfavorable, and 23 paragraphs were found neutral. So, according to the results, the stance/slant of the daily was found equally neutral and favorable. No unfavorable paragraphs were found by the study in the daily's coverage about the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. This indicates that the coverage about Indian Muslims produced by Daily Dawn was 50% neutral and 50% favorable.

THE NATION SLANT & MAGNITUDE

This research examined six months of editorials (August 11, 2019 to February 11, 2020) of The Nation newspaper to ascertain the stance/slant and magnitude of the daily's coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. As demonstrated by *Table 4.4*, 10 editorials (Total 39 paragraphs) were published by the daily regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. This indicates that the daily's coverage give to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims in terms of total paragraphs published by the daily is low as compare to Dawn. Thus, the result shows that the magnitude of coverage given by The Nation newspaper to the Indian Muslims is extremely scarce as compare to the Dawn investigated by this study.

With regards to the stance/slant of the daily regards the coverage given to the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims, out of the 39 paragraphs of the total 10 editorials, 23 paragraphs were found favorable, 0 was unfavorable, and 16 paragraphs were found neutral by this study. So, according to the results, the stance/slant of the daily was found predominantly favorable towards the Indian Muslims. No unfavorable paragraphs were found by the study.

TOTAL SLANT & MAGNITUDE DISTRIBUTION

Through a six months of content analysis of four different English dailies editorials (Two Indian and Two Pakistani), the study founded a total of 57 editorials published in all four different newspapers. 23 by Times of India, 14 by Hindustan Times, and 10 each by the Daily Dawn and The Nation. With regards to the stance/slant of the newspapers, 22 (38.59%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 35 (61.40%) editorials were found neutral.

Magnitude

This study found that the total amount of coverage collectively given to the deteriorating condition of Indian Muslims by all four newspapers were neither low nor high, it can be categorized as average. The Time of India has given the highest amount of coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims as compare to the Hindustan Times. The Hindustan Times falls into the second place in terms of the amount of coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. However, the two Pakistani dailies, Dawn and The Nation, have given equal amount of coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims.

Slant

With regards to the stance/slant, this research reveals that the coverage of all the four dailies was predominantly neutral. However, a fairly huge amount of coverage of all the four different dailies was favorable. No unfavorable coverage was founded in all four newspapers by this study. The Times of India and Hindustan Times coverage were founded predominantly neutral. Daily dawn coverage was predominantly favorable. The Nation newspaper coverage was 50% neutral and 50% favorable.

CONCLUSION

This research investigates the media coverage of the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. Through content analysis, this study examines the stance/slant and magnitude of the coverage the media gives to the deteriorating conditions on Indian Muslims. The first objective of this research was to ascertain the stance/slant of the coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims by the Pakistan & Indian English print media. The second objective was to ascertain the magnitude of coverage given to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims by the Pakistani & Indian English print media.

By conducting content analysis, four dailies editorial were examined and compared (both county's daily's comparison was done separately, it was not cross-compared). Two Indian elite English dailies (Times of India & Hindustan Times) and two Pakistani elite English dailies (Dawn & The Nation) were selected for the content analysis. Six months (Aug 11, 2019 to Feb 11, 2020) of editorials were selected of the said dailies for the content analysis. A total of 57 editorials were published all together in four different newspapers regarding the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims. 23 editorials in Times of India, 14 in Hindustan Times, and 10 each in Dawn and The Nation were published. The study reveals that the Times of India has given more coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims than the Hindustan Times. However, the Pakistanis daily's, Dawn and The Nation, has given an equal amount of coverage to the deteriorating conditions of Indian Muslims.

In the Time of India, 7 (30.43%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 16 (69.56%) editorials were found neutral. In the Hindustan Times, 3 (21.42%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 11 (78.57%) editorials were found neutral. In Dawn, 7 (70%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 3 (30%) editorials were found neutral. In The Nation, 5 (50%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable and 5 (50%) editorials were found neutral. In total all four newspapers, out of the 57 editorials, 22 (38.59%) editorials were found favorable, 0 (0.0%) unfavorable, and 35 (61.40%) editorials were found neutral. With regard to the stance/slant, this research reveals that the coverage of all the four dailies was predominantly neutral. However, a fairly huge amount of coverage of all the four different dailies was favorable. No Unfavorable coverage was found in all four dailies.

REFERENCES

- Adcock, C. (2018). Cow Protection and Minority Rights in India: Reassessing Religious Freedom. *Asian Affairs*, 49(2), 340-354.
- Afaq, M. F. (2015, January) Coverage of Indian newspapers on Muslim issues: Content analysis of The Times of India and The Hindu. *International Journal of Communication and Social Research*, 3(1).
- Ahmed, A. N., & MA, M. (2016). A Study on the Representation of Islam and Muslims in Tirunelveli Edition of Tamil Dailies. *J Mass Communicat Journalism*, 6 (291). doi:10.4172/2165-7912.1000291.
- Ahmed, S. (2010). The role of the media during communal riots in India: A study of the 1984 Sikh riots and the 2002 Gujarat riots. *Media Asia*, 37(2), 103-111.
- Alam, M. T. (2019). Democracy and Indian Muslims as Unequal. *International Journal of Trend in Scientific Research and Development (IJTSRD)*, 3(3), 742-745.
- Ali, U. (2017, July 20). *Self-Censorship in the English Print Media of Pakistan*. (Dissertation). Riphah International University, Rawalpindi.
- Azharudeen. (2016). The Representation of Islam and Muslims In the Indian Media. (Dissertation). Manhajur Rashad Islamic College, Darul Huda Islamic University, Kerala.
- Basant, R. (2007). Social, economic and educational conditions of Indian Muslims. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 828-832.
- Bhat, M. R., Iqbal, K., & Akhtar, S. (2017, July). Portrayal Of Muslims As Threat To Society By The Media-An Overview In Indian Context. *International Journal of Innovative Research and Advanced Studies (IJIRAS)*, 4(7).
- Engineer, A. A. (2004). Islam and Muslims in India. Problems of Identity and Existence. *Oriente moderno*, 23(1), 71-82. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/25817918?seq=1>
- Engineer, I. (2015, July). Modi, Terrorism, and Indian Muslims. *Secular Perspective*. <https://csss-islam.com/secular-perspective/modi-terrorism-and-indian-muslims/>
- Zelizer, B., & Allan, S. (Eds.). (2011). *Journalism after september 11*. Taylor & Francis.
- Graff, V., & Galonnier, J. (2012). Hindu-Muslim Communal Riots in India II (1986-2011). *Online Encyclopedia of Mass Violence, Paris, Sciences Po, CERI*. <https://www.sciencespo.fr/mass-violence-war-massacre-resistance/en/document/hindu-muslim-communal-riots-india-i-1947-1986.html>

- Jaffrelot, C. (1996). *The Hindu Nationalist Movement in India 1925 to the 1990s*. New Delhi: Viking.
- Jaffrelot, C. (2017). India's democracy at 70: Toward a Hindu state?. *Journal of Democracy*, 28(3), 52-63.
- Kattarwala, N. (2010, January). The portrayal of Islam in the Indian mass media. In *MeCCSA (Media, Communication and Cultural Studies Association) Conference, London, United Kingdom*.
- Koushik, M. (2013). *Reimagining 'Good Muslim, Bad Muslim': Public Theologies of Citizenship and Belonging in the Republic of India* (Doctoral dissertation). Brown University, Rhode Island.
- Kumar, A. (2011). Mass media and Muslims in India: Representation or subversion. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 31(1), 59-77.
- Kutty, F. (1997). Indian Muslims: rebuilding a community. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 17(1), 167-177.
- Liyakat, M. (2017). *Image of Muslims in Mainstream English Dailies of India: A Critical Analysis of Four Major Newspapers During 2007 & 2017*. (Dissertation). Aligarh Muslim University, Aligarh.
- Mainuddin, M. (2011). Socio-economic conditions and political representation of Indian Muslims: A study of West Bengal. *Researchers World*, 2(4), 123.
- Majid, A., & Farooq, S. (2019). Socio-Political and Economic Status of Minorities In India. *Pakistan Vision*, 20(1), 1.
- Mistry, M. B. (2005). Muslims in India: A demographic and socio-economic profile. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 25(3), 399-422.
- Moore, R. J. (1983). Jinnah and the Pakistan demand. *Modern Asian Studies*, 17(4), 529-561. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/312235?seq=1>
- Narayana, U., & Kapur, P. (2011). Indian media framing of the image of Muslims: An analysis of news coverage of Muslims in English newspapers of India. *Media Asia*, 38(3), 153-162.
- Nurullah, A. S. (2010). Portrayal of Muslims in the media: "24" and the 'Othering' process. *International Journal of Human Sciences*, 7(1), 1020-1046.
- Sajjad, M. W. (2018). Examining the State of Muslim Minority under Modi's BJP since 2014. *Strategic Studies*, 38(4), 19-36.
- Sarantakos, S. (2012). *Social Research* (4th Edition). Palgrave Macmillan
- Sarkar, S. (2016). Fascism and the BJP. *Frontier Weekly* https://www.academia.edu/24879357/Fascism_and_the_BJP

Savarkar, V. D. (2016). *Essentials of hindutva*. http://savarkar.org/en/encyc/2017/5/23/2_12_12_04_essentials_of_hindutva.v001.pdf_1.pdf

Swamy, A. R. (2003). *Hindu Nationalism-What's Religion Got to Do with It*. ASIA-PACIFIC CENTER FOR SECURITY STUDIES HONOLULU HI HONOLULU. United States.

Varadarajan, S. (Ed.). (2002). *Gujarat, the Making of a Tragedy*. Penguin Books. India.

Weber, R. P. (1990). *Basic content analysis* (No. 49). Sage.

Wimmer, R. D., & Dominick, J. R. (2013). Mass media research: Cengage learning. *Yang-Wallentin, F., Schmidt, P., Davidov, E., & Bamberg, S.*(2004). *Is there any interaction effect between intention and perceived behavioral control. Methods of Psychological Research Online, 8*(2), 127-157.

Zelizer, B. & Allan, S. (2002). *Journalism after september 11*. London: Routledge.

ELECTRONIC REFERENCES

URL-1 <https://go.usa.gov/xUG4t> (Date of access: 27.01.2020)

URL-2 <https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/India.pdf> (Date of access: 06.02.2020)

URL-3 [https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/et-explains/citizenship-amendment-bill-what-does-it-do-and-why-is-it-seen-as-a-problem/articleshow/72436995.cms#:~:text=The%20act%20seeks%20to%20amend,lived%20in%20India%20without%20documentation.&text=Protests%20have%20broken%20out%20across,Citizenship%20\(Amendment\)%20Act%202019](https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/et-explains/citizenship-amendment-bill-what-does-it-do-and-why-is-it-seen-as-a-problem/articleshow/72436995.cms#:~:text=The%20act%20seeks%20to%20amend,lived%20in%20India%20without%20documentation.&text=Protests%20have%20broken%20out%20across,Citizenship%20(Amendment)%20Act%202019) (Date of access: 12.02.2020)

URL-4 <https://www.eastasiaforum.org/2018/05/15/hindu-nationalism-in-india-a-century-in-the-making/> (Date of access: 10.02.2020)

URL-5 <https://www.kennedy.senate.gov/public/press-releases?ID=DF710F32-39E9-41B2-BBE1-E265F4057E4A> (Date of access: 15.02.2020)

URL-6 <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/may/26/india-muslims-narendra-modi-bjp-new-dawn> (Date of access: 23.02.2020)

URL-7 <https://foreignpolicy.com/2019/09/26/in-kashmir-modi-is-failing-both-muslims-and-hindus/> (Date of access: 19.02.2020)

URL-8 <https://frontline.thehindu.com/the-nation/muslims-today/article10074503.ece> (Date of access: 02.03.2020)

URL-9 <https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/india/how-indian-news-channels-are-peddling-hatred-against-muslims-on-primetime-tv-1.67265166#> (Date of access: 06.03.2020)

URL-10 <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/yogic-madness-yogi-adityanath-uttar-pradesh-bjp-narendra-modi-4576588/> (Date of access: 18.03.2020)

URL-11 <https://www.dw.com/en/indian-religious-minorities-face-increased-violence-under-modi-report/a-49346394> (Date of access: 12.03.2020)

URL-12 <https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2018/country-chapters/india> (Date of access: 25.03.2020)

URL-13 <https://www.newyorker.com/news/on-religion/the-violent-toll-of-hindu-nationalism-in-india> (Date of access: 03.04.2020)

URL-14 <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2016/06/01/u-s-senators-attack-indias-human-rights-record-before-modis-capitol-hill-address/> (Date of access: 16.04.2020)

URL-15 <https://www.theguardian.com/books/2019/aug/05/malevolent-republic-short-history-of-new-india-ks-komireddi-review> (Date of access: 27.04.2020)

URL-16 <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/dec/22/bjp-citizenship-amendment-act-indians> (Date of access: 27.04.2020)

URL-17 <https://www.forbes.com/sites/ronakdesai/2016/05/31/the-real-significance-of-prime-minister-modis-address-to-congress/#1f9ef64b4b51> (Date of access: 10.05.2020)

URL-18 http://www.india-seminar.com/2016/677/677_rakesh_basant.htm (Date of access: 16.05.2020)

URL-19 <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/18/world/asia/firebrand-hindu-cleric-yogi-adityanath-picked-as-uttar-pradesh-minister.html> (Date of access: 06.05.2020)

URL-20 <https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/POL10/6700/2018/En/> (Date of access: 16.05.2020)

URL-21 <https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/2018/12/06/modis-india-is-living-nightmare-muslims/> (Date of access: 22.05.2020)

URL-22 https://roundtableindia.co.in/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=9700:democracy-and-indian-muslims-living-in-peril&catid=129:events-and-activism&Itemid=195 (Date of access: 29.05.2020)